

Pluralistic Tools for Policy Analysis  
20 July 2005

Samuel A. Evans  
University of Oxford

JamesMartinInstitute  
for science and  
civilization

# A Critique of Current Pluralistic Conceptual Tools for Policy Analysis

- Identify realm of applicability and point of analysis
- Draw connections and show distinctions between tools

# Pluralistic Tools

## Cultural Theory

Preferences

Balance

<b>Realm of Applicability</b>	Create a viable policy system
<b>Focus of Analysis</b>	Interaction of solidarities

JamesMartinInstitute  
for science and  
civilization

RAYNER, S. & MALONE, E. L. (1998) *Human choice and climate change*. Vol.1 'The societal framework.' Columbus, Ohio, Battelle Press.  
THOMPSON, M., ELLIS, R. & WILDAVSKY, A. B. (1990) *Cultural theory* Oxford, Westview.

# Agricultural Biotechnology

## Cultural Theory

- Agreement within US
  - “substantial equivalence” clause
- EU sees it as uncertain
- Dispute at the WTO

# Pluralistic Tools

## Advocacy Coalition

Preferences

Current system

<b>Realm of Applicability</b>	Promote a particular policy view
<b>Focus of Analysis</b>	Elite coalitions of preferences

JamesMartinInstitute  
for science and  
civilization

SABATIER, P. A. & JENKINS-SMITH, H. C. (Eds.), (1993) *Policy change and learning: an advocacy coalition approach* Oxford, Westview Press.

# Agricultural Biotechnology

## Advocacy Coalition

- Agreement within US
  - “substantial equivalence” clause
- EU sees it as uncertain
- Dispute at the WTO

# Pluralistic Tools

## Argumentation

Current systems

Balance

**Realm of  
Applicability**

Creating internally  
coherent and  
externally  
compelling policy

**Focus of  
Analysis**

Those who make  
policy

JamesMartinInstitute  
for science and  
civilization

FISCHER, F. & FORESTER, J. (Eds.), (1993) *The argumentative turn in policy analysis and planning* London, Duke University Press.

# Agricultural Biotechnology

## Argumentation

- Agreement within US
  - “substantial equivalence” clause
- EU sees it as uncertain
- Dispute at the WTO

# Comparing Pluralistic Tools

	Cultural Theory	Advocacy Coalition	Argumentation
<b>Realm of Applicability</b>	Create a viable policy system	Promote a particular policy view	Creating internally coherent and externally compelling policy
<b>Focus of Analysis</b>	Interaction of sets of preferences	Elite coalitions of preferences	Those who make policy
<b>Similarities</b>			
Appropriate unit of analysis is sets of preferences, not common vocation	✓	✓	✗
Develop balanced policy between actors	✓	✗	✓
Analysis stays within current policy system	✗	✓	✓

JamesMartinInstitute  
for science and  
civilization